

# Belgium: mobility data

**Pascale Steinberg**

Health Workforce Planning team

DG2 - Primary Health Care and Crisis Management

FPS Health, Food Chain Safety and Environment

**Budapest June 2013**



# Homework

- What are the main health professional data sources in your country related to mobility e.g. diploma recognitions, good standing certificates, registrations at chambers? Please add data sources. Does your country have more data sources e.g. labour market data, also related to HWF mobility?
- Which healthcare professions are covered by mobility data (inflow and outflow mobility)?
- What are the main indicators regarding health professional mobility applied in your country? (Do they cover WHO indicators: Country of degree, Country of birth, Country of nationality. See Feasibility Study p.35. Figure 5.)
- Can you evaluate the validity and reliability of this data?
- In case you have a health workforce planning process in your country, are mobility data considered?
- Do you keep contact with authorities of other nations to map international flow of your HWF?
- Do you supply information to DG Markt database on mutually recognised degrees?
- What is the added value of considering international mobility data in health workforce planning in your consideration?



## Brief information about Belgium

Surface: 30.500 km<sup>2</sup>

Inhabitants: 11.094.850 (01/01/12)

Registered health professionals in Federal Database: 411. 594 (31/12/12)

### Complex political structure :

- 3 regions: Brussel Capital region, Flemish region, Walloon region
- 3 communities: French Community, Flemish Community, German Community

### Distribution of powers (federal, regional, by community):

- recognition of health professionals: **federal level**
- education : **level of communities**



# Federal database of health professionals

Number of health professionals authorized to practice -31/12/2012.

	All	Residing in Belgium
Physicians	56.127	<b>48.706</b>
Dentists	9.763	<b>8.866</b>
Physiotherapists	34.972	29.007
Health care assistants	86.411	84.142
Nurses	174.849	<b>166.659</b>
Midwives	9.542	9.004
Pharmacists	18.350	17.524
Paramedicals	21.580	21.290
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>411.594</b>	<b>385.198</b>



# Main data sources related to health professional mobility

## Federal Health Ministry:

- Recognition of professional qualification (European diplomas)  
-> **Inflow**
- Conformity certificates -> **Outflow**
- Federal Database of Health Professionals

## Community:

- Equivalence for non CEE diplomas



# Health professional data sources

## 2 directions of mobility - 2 procedures

### ▪ Professionals coming INTO Belgium:

#### recognition of professional qualifications procedure

2 methods:

- *automatic (Directive 2005/36/CE)*
- *based on the general system*

### ▪ Professionals leaving Belgium (OUT) :

#### Conformity certificates

Nationality = **nationality of diploma** and not the nationality of the holder

Available data

= intention to migrate

≠ effective migration



## Which healthcare professions are covered by mobility data?

### Data available for following professions

- ❖ Physician: 6 year study (basis physician)
- ❖ Physician specialist (including general practitioner)
- ❖ Dentist
- ❖ Pharmacist
- ❖ Physiotherapist
- ❖ Nurse
- ❖ Midwife
- ❖ Paramedical professions



# Main indicators regarding health professional mobility

## Before 2012:

Only registration of the **number** of files

- ✓ recognition = number depending on the diploma's nationality and for each profession
- ✓ Conformity certificate = number for each profession

## From 2012:

Transition period: integration in the Federal database

More indicators: owner's nationality, gender, age, address, specialty,...

=> **new perspectives**





# Validity and reliability of this data(1/2)

## Limitations of recognition

- (small) Overestimation
- Intention  $\neq$  effective mobility
- Diploma's nationality  $\neq$  owner's nationality

Recognition=More reliable data

## Limitations of conformity certificate

- Intention  $\neq$  effective mobility
- Diploma's nationality  $\neq$  owner's nationality
- (more important) underestimation
- Not systematically requested
- Also includes foreign students returning to their home country
- Comparison made with data from France and Netherlands

*Health Professional Mobility and Health Systems,  
Evidence from 17 European countries,  
European observatory on Health systems and Policies, 2011*



## Validity and reliability of this data(2/2)

**Professional mobility ⇔ student mobility**

**Important number of foreign students in Belgium**

- **Mainly French students in the French community, because of quotas to the entrance of the studies in France**
- **French community imposed maximal quotas of foreign students (30%)**

**Basis physicians complete medical training in Belgium (coming for specialization)**



# Mobility data considered in health workforce planning process?

Only inflow data (recognition) is integrated in the Belgian mathematical Planning models, because of the higher level of reliability



# Contact with authorities of other nations to map international flow?

## Contact through the IMI System

Internal Market Information System (IMI), developed by the European Commission:

[http://ec.europa.eu/internal\\_market/imi-net/index\\_fr.html](http://ec.europa.eu/internal_market/imi-net/index_fr.html)

### Frequency:

- 2 demands FROM other countries/week
- 1 demand TO other countries/week



## Added value of considering international mobility data in health workforce planning?

- **Validation of inflow and outflow** ( from the intention to the effective mobility)
- **Greater coherence** of national planning based on quotas  
→ Why limit access to the profession for the Belgian graduates when we allow a free inflow of foreign graduates?

**Belgian quotas** determine a maximum number of Belgian graduates

Graduate students with foreign diplomas who specialize in Belgium are not considered in these quotas



# Quota system

## Which professions are concerned ?

### **Physicians :** access to specialty

- *a general maximum quota (not to exceed)*  
*With a repartition into each communities*
- *minimum quota (to fulfill) for some speciality*
  - *General practionner, Psychiatre infanto-juvéniles, médecine aiguë, médecine d'urgence, et geriatry*

### **Dentists :** access to specialty

- *a general maximum quota (not to exceed)*

### **Physiotherapists:** access to private practice

- *a maximum quota for liberal exercice (private pratice)*

**There is no limitation for nurses**



# Mobility data: entrance in Belgium: recognition of professional qualification

## Data available for following professions

- ❖ Physician: 6 year study (basis physician)
- ❖ Physician specialist (including general practitioner)
- ❖ Dentist
- ❖ Pharmacist
- ❖ Physiotherapist
- ❖ Nursing
- ❖ Midwife
- ❖ Paramedical professions



## Basis Physician – recognition of qualifications according to the diploma's nationality

Diploma	Code	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total
Autriche	AT	3	3	2	2	1	11
Bulgarie	BG	4	10	10	7	12	43
Suisse	CH	9	3	1	0	5	18
Rép. Tchèque	CZ	2	4	3	3	3	15
Allemagne	DE	22	37	20	25	38	142
Danemark	DK	2	0	0	0	0	2
Espagne	ES	8	4	4	11	17	44
Finlande	FI	1	0	0	0	0	1
France	FR	80	61	38	68	98	345
Grande Bretagne	GB	6	6	2	4	2	20
Grece	GR	20	27	26	21	28	122
Hongrie	HU	3	4	2	4	2	15
Irlande	IE	0	1	1	1	1	4
Italie	IT	31	24	37	38	61	191
Lituanie	LT	2	2	3	3	5	15
Luxembourg	LU	0	0	0	3	0	3
Lettonie	LV	1	1	2	2	3	9
Malte	MT	0	0	0	1	2	3
Pays Bas	NL	67	70	42	35	58	272
Pologne	PL	6	7	6	6	6	31
Portugal	PT	0	2	3	6	3	14
Roumanie	RO	134	133	153	163	178	761
Suede	SE	0	1	0	2	1	4
Slovénie	SI	0	0	0	1	0	1
Slovaquie	SK	2	0	0	0	5	7
<b>Total</b>		<b>403</b>	<b>400</b>	<b>355</b>	<b>406</b>	<b>529</b>	<b>2093</b>



## Specialist physician – recognition of qualifications according to the diploma's nationality

Diploma	Code	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total
Autriche	AT	2	0	0	1	1	4
Bulgarie	BG	1	4	3	1	4	13
Suisse	CH	1	1	1	3	4	10
Rep. Tchèque	CZ	0	0	1	0	2	3
Allemagne	DE	21	12	14	18	28	93
Danemark	DK	1	0	0	0	0	1
Espagne	ES	2	1	1	1	2	7
France	FR	20	27	24	31	50	152
Grande Bretagne	GB	5	3	6	0	3	17
Grece	GR	5	4	3	5	10	27
Hongrie	HU	0	1	2	0	3	6
Irlande	IE	0	0	0	1	1	2
Italie	IT	10	10	5	6	11	42
Lituanie	LT	1	0	0	4	2	7
Lettonie	LV	1	2	1	0	0	4
Pays Bas	NL	16	16	29	15	34	110
Norvege	NO	1	0	0	0	0	1
Pologne	PL	2	1	3	2	2	10
Portugal	PT	1	0	0	1	1	3
Roumanie	RO	13	25	28	41	70	177
Suède	SE	1	1	0	0	1	3
Slovaquie	SK	0	0	0	0	3	3
<b>Total</b>		<b>104</b>	<b>108</b>	<b>121</b>	<b>130</b>	<b>232</b>	<b>695</b>

## dentist— recognition of qualifications according to the diploma's nationality

Diploma	code	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total
Autriche	AT	1	0	0	1	1	3
Bulgarie	BG	1	7	2	0	2	12
Rep. Tchèque	CZ	0	0	0	0	1	1
Allemagne	DE	0	6	6	0	5	17
Danemark	DK	1	0	1	1	0	3
Espagne	ES	0	1	0	4	5	10
France	FR	12	11	6	8	9	46
Grande Bretagne	GB	0	1	1	0	0	2
Grèce	GR	1	0	1	0	0	2
Hongrie	HU	1	0	0	2	1	4
Italie	IT	0	0	1	1	1	3
Lettonie	LV	0	0	0	0	2	2
Pays-Bas	NL	3	23	5	3	4	38
Pologne	PL	0	1	3	7	4	15
Portugal	PT	1	1	2	1	1	6
Roumanie	RO	1	9	3	7	21	41
Suède	SE	0	0	0	0	1	1
<b>Total</b>		<b>22</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>31</b>	<b>35</b>	<b>58</b>	<b>206</b>

**19** pharmacist– recognition of qualifications according to the diploma's nationality

Diploma	code	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total
Bulgarie	BG	0	0	0	0	1	1
Suisse	CH	0	0	0	0	1	1
Rép. Tchèque	CZ	0	0	0	1	0	1
Allemagne	DE	1	1	3	2	3	10
Danemark	DK	0	0	0	0	2	2
Espagne	ES	0	3	2	6	3	14
France	FR	13	11	14	19	12	69
Royaume-Uni	GB	1	0	0	0	3	4
Grèce	GR	0	0	0	0	1	1
Hongrie	HU	1	0	0	0	0	1
Italie	IT	1	2	3	2	3	11
Lituanie	LT	0	0	1	0	0	1
Malte	MT	1	0	0	0	0	1
Pays-Bas	NL	3	3	4	6	3	19
Pologne	PL	0	0	0	0	2	2
Portugal	PT	0	0	0	0	1	1
Roumanie	RO	0	0	5	4	16	25
<b>Total</b>		<b>21</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>51</b>	<b>164</b>

# Nurses - Entry into the profession

Two levels of training in Belgium

- **Undergraduate**

12 + 3 years  
Without bachelor

- **Graduate nurse (bachelor of graduate) - BSN**

12 + 3 Years  
With bachelor



**Undergraduate nurse**  
recognition of qualifications according to the diploma's nationality

21

Diploma	Code	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total
Bulgarie	BG	1	0	1	8	19	29
Suisse	CH	0	0	0	1	0	1
Allemagne	DE	28	14	13	24	11	90
Finlande	FI	0	0	0	0	1	1
Hongrie	HU	0	0	1	0	0	1
Italie	IT	0	0	1	0	0	1
Finlande	FI	1	0	0	0	0	1
France	FR	1	1	0	0	2	4
Lettonie	LV	0	0	0	0	1	1
Italie	IT		1	0	0	0	1
Luxembourg	LU	2	2	0	0	0	4
Pays Bas	NL	33	26	23	27	57	166
Pologne	PL	5	5	7	1	18	36
Roumanie	RO	8	2	3	22	160	195
Slovaquie	SK	1	0	0	1	0	2
<b>Total</b>		<b>80</b>	<b>51</b>	<b>49</b>	<b>84</b>	<b>269</b>	<b>533</b>

**Graduate nurse  
recognition of qualifications according to the diploma's nationality**

Diploma	Code	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	Total
Bulgarie	BG	0	7	2	2	7	18
Suisse	CH	1	0	4	3	2	10
Danemark	DK	0	0	0	1	1	2
Espagne	ES	11	6	5	6	16	44
Finlande	FI	2	0	0	1	1	4
France	FR	95	132	110	102	123	562
Grande Bretagne	GB	3	3	6	1	2	15
Grèce	GR	0	0	2	0	0	2
Irlande	IE	0	0	1	0	0	1
Italie	IT	0	4	2	8	11	25
Lituanie	LT	0	0	0	1	3	4
Luxembourg	LU	0	0	0	1	1	2
Malte	MT	0	0	1	0	0	1
Pays-Bas	NL	13	16	9	13	14	65
Pologne	PL	0	2	15	66	51	134
Portugal	PT	1	5	4	30	106	146
Roumanie	RO	4	8	9	34	24	79
Suède	SE	0	0	1	0	0	1
<b>Total</b>		<b>130</b>	<b>183</b>	<b>171</b>	<b>269</b>	<b>362</b>	<b>1115</b>

# Conformity certificate (emigration)

23

Conformity certificate	2008	2009	2010	2011
<b>Total</b>	<b>2.015</b>	<b>1.290</b>	<b>1.364</b>	<b>1.496</b>
General practitioner	34	35	29	34
Specialist physicians	281	224	184	254
Basis physicians	217	211	178	196
Pharmacist	42	43	39	38
Dentist	23	29	35	36
Specialist Dentist	0	2	3	0
Nurse secondary level	128	139	165	164
Nurse post secondary level (bac)	145	167	157	200

# Current issues - international mobility in Belgium(1 / 4)

24

## Number of recognitions of professional qualifications relative to new entrants into profession

- Specialist physicians
- Dentists
- Nurses

Evolution from 2008 to 2011





# Current issues - international mobility in Belgium (2/4)

25

Number of professional recognitions - **SPECIALIST PHYSICIAN**-granted in relation to new entrants in profession (2008-2011)

SPECIALIST PHYSICIAN	2008	2009	2010	2011
<b>Recognition (R)</b>	<b>108</b>	<b>121</b>	<b>130</b>	<b>232</b>
<b>New entrants (E)</b>	<b>2.053</b>	<b>1.363</b>	<b>952</b>	<b>1.088</b>
<b>Proportion (R/E)</b>	<b>5,3</b>	<b>8,9</b>	<b>13,6</b>	<b>21,3</b>



# Current issues - international mobility in Belgium (3/4)

26

Number of professional recognitions - DENTIST - granted in relation to new entrants in profession (2008-2011)

DENTIST	2008	2009	2010	2011
Recognition (R)	60	31	35	58
New entrants (E)	147	122	140	150
Proportion (R/E)	40,8	25,4	25,0	38,6



# Current issues - international mobility in Belgium (4/4)

27

Number of professional recognitions - NURSE - granted in relation to new entrants in profession (2008-2011)

NURSE	2008	2009	2010	2011
Recognition (R)	234	220	353	631
New entrants (E)	481	793	1.812	1.692
Proportion (R/E)	48,6	27,7	19,5	37,3

